



Ni Made Estiyanti <estiyanti@primakara.ac.id>

FW: Your submission to Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship - JIAE-D-23-00147

1 message

Dr. Máté Domicián <mate.domician@eng.unideb.hu>
To: "novotny.adam" <novotny.adam@uni-eszterhazy.hu>
Cc: "estiyanti@primakara.ac.id" <estiyanti@primakara.ac.id>

Tue, Oct 24, 2023 at 10:30 AM

Dear Team

Latest version and reviewers.

D.

-----Original Message-----

From: em.jiae.0.86e38f.afe3466d@editorialmanager.com <em.jiae.0.86e38f.afe3466d@editorialmanager.com> On Behalf Of Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship Editorial Office
Sent: Monday, October 23, 2023 2:10 PM
To: Dr. Máté Domicián <mate.domician@eng.unideb.hu>
Subject: Your submission to Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship - JIAE-D-23-00147

FIGYELEM: Ez a levél külső feladótól származik. Ne kattintson semmire a levélben, és ne nyissa meg a csatolmányt, amennyiben a küldő e-mail címét nem ismeri fel!

CC: caraye@gwu.edu, s.sindakis@iseeg.org, ssindakis@ctbu.edu.cn, sindakis.stavros@ac.eap.gr

JIAE-D-23-00147

How to Support Innovative Small Firms? Bibliometric Analysis and Visualization of Start-up Incubation Domicián Máté; Ni Made Estiyanti; Adam Novotny Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship

Dear Dr. Máté,

Your manuscript 'How to Support Innovative Small Firms? Bibliometric Analysis and Visualization of Start-up Incubation' (JIAE-D-23-00147) has been assessed by our reviewers. Based on these reports, and my own assessment as Editor, I am pleased to inform you that it is potentially acceptable for publication in Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship, once you have carried out some essential revisions suggested by our reviewers.

Their reports, together with any other comments, are below. Please also take a moment to check our website at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jiae/> for any additional comments that were saved as attachments.

Once you have made the necessary corrections, please submit a revised manuscript online at:

Your username is: matedomi

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jiae/>.

Please include a point-by-point response within the 'Response to Reviewers' box in the submission system and highlight (with 'tracked changes'/coloured/underlines/highlighted text) all changes made when revising the manuscript. Please ensure you describe additional experiments that were carried out and include a detailed rebuttal of any criticisms or requested revisions that you disagreed with. Please also ensure that your revised manuscript conforms to the journal style, which can be found in the Submission Guidelines on the journal homepage.

The due date for submitting the revised version of your article is 02 Nov 2023.

Please note, if your manuscript is accepted you will not be able to make any changes to the authors, or order of authors, of your manuscript once the editor has accepted your manuscript for publication. If you wish to make any changes to authorship before you resubmit your revisions, please reply to this email and ask for a 'Request for change in authorship' form which should be completed by all authors (including those to be removed) and returned to this email address. Please ensure that any changes in authorship fulfil the criteria for authorship as outlined in SpringerOpen's editorial policies (<http://www.springeropen.com/get-published/editorial-policies#authorship>).

Once you have completed and returned the form, your request will be considered and you will be advised whether the requested changes will be allowed.

By resubmitting your manuscript you confirm that all author details on the revised version are correct, that all authors have agreed to authorship and order of authorship for this manuscript and that all authors have the appropriate permissions and rights to the reported data.

Please be aware that we may investigate, or ask your institute to investigate, any unauthorised attempts to change authorship or discrepancies in authorship between the submitted and revised versions of your manuscript.

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript soon.

Best wishes,

Elias G. Carayannis, PhD

Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship <https://innovation-entrepreneurship.springeropen.com/>

Reviewer reports:

Editors' comments (if any) :

Reviewer #1: Thanks to the authors and editors for the opportunity to read and review the manuscript of 'How to Support Innovative Small Firms? Bibliometric Analysis and Visualization of Start-up Incubation.' This review article is based on the existing entrepreneurship literature on understanding both the drivers and barriers of start-up incubation. In particular, this study reveals insights into supporting business and academic spin-offs in several contributions. The reviewer concludes that the paper submitted meets the requirements of the journal. The topic seems stimulating, but minor changes are needed and additional amendments are suggested to improve its contribution. Generally, the manuscript can be accepted with minor changes.

Additional amendments:

- * A concrete research gap should be emphasized in why the topic is selected. In the introduction, answer two main questions: "Why was this particular study needed to fill this gap in current scientific knowledge?" Describe the rationale in the context of what is known and not in this research area.
 - * The study should include a statement of hypotheses or questions about the literature, methods, results, study design, etc.
 - * Data selection should be more explained to maintain the integrity, transparency and reproducibility of research records. Why was the Scopus database only selected and/or not WOS?
 - * An evolution of the literature would also be expected in the bibliometric review based on geographical location.
 - * What is the concept of sustainability-profiled business incubators?
 - * What is the author's knowledge about the determinants of transition from the incubation process to actual entrepreneurship?
 - * What are the success factors of start-up incubation programs can depend on the characteristics of the local ecosystem? What does that start-ups as enablers of a broader societal impact is limited mean?
 - * What are differences of the economic and social dimensions of sustainability as well as the specific needs and challenges start-ups face?
 - * The primary novelty of the paper is the complexity of the research methods, in addition to identifying and comprehensively understand and visualize different research perspectives on how start-ups are incubated. However, the conclusion chapter should go beyond the interpretation of the results.
 - * For instance, the main objective of this study was to examine the effects of small enterprises on the innovation processes, to shed light on novel research perspectives on business incubation. A bibliometric analysis was used to analyze impacts of startups while also considering e.g., sustainability.
 - * The advantage of the research model, contradictions to the previous approaches and the findings are also important for policymakers should be declared.
- Congrats for the authors and keep working.

Reviewer #2: I appreciate the chance to evaluate the draft of "How to Support Innovative Small Firms?" from the Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship. The bibliometric review indicates an effective tool for synthesizing research trends, identifying gaps, and providing insights for future research and provide a comprehensive interpretation of the research landscape, and approaches used to study start-up incubation by scholars from a variety of business sectors.

The paper offers some interesting insights and adequate bibliometric methods, and the topic seems interesting, but some corrections are needed to upgrade its current level. For instance, including its grounding in the abstract, introduction and conclusion. Overall, from my perspective, the manuscript can be approved (minor changes) after the following issues and requests are resolved:

- * It is not entirely obvious how the paper assesses the societal impact of start-ups and their consequences of innovation in entrepreneurship setting that considers both historical evolution and geographic location.
- * Place the purpose of the study into a broad context, and briefly describe the main findings, and indicate the conclusions or interpretations within the abstract.

- * The introduction should highlight its importance. The problem statement based on the previous results and the novelty of this study should also be declared here.
 - * The conjectural background should be provided with an explicit statement of research question(s)/hypotheses being addressed concerning the literature comparison how it relates to the previous theoretical and empirical literature.
 - * Data selection should be more explained. Refer on carefully how and why this case study (based on only Scopus) and why the materials, and data design are selected.
 - * What the authors mean by the success of incubators and accelerators?
 - * What are the factors for sustainable start-ups and business models, tenant recruitment, and processes to support sustainability-profiled incubators?
 - * Please identify more gaps in the existing literature and highlight areas for future research.
- Good luck for the improvement.

Reviewer #3: Special thanks to the Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship for the opportunity to review the manuscript of 'How to Support Innovative Small Firms? Bibliometric Analysis and Visualization of Start-up Incubation.' This study draws on current entrepreneurship literature to comprehend and illustrate several research viewpoints on the incubation of start-up businesses.

The reviewer concludes that the submitted manuscript complies with the journal's standards. The subject looks intriguing, but some small adjustments are required, and other suggestions are made to enhance its value. The manuscript can be approved with modest revisions.

- * A declaration of hypotheses or questions regarding the literature and methodology should be included in the study.
- * The intricacy of the research methodologies, together with the ability to recognize, comprehend and graphically represent many study viewpoints on the incubation of start-ups, constitute the novelties of the paper. To improve the benefits of the study, inconsistencies with earlier theories, and discoveries that are also significant for policymakers should be more clearly stated.
- * What does it indicate that start-ups have a limited influence on society as enablers? What is the importance of social benefits to incubators/accelerators when develop startups or spinoffs? Encouraging a better awareness of the connections between startups and other countries and cultures, the preservation and enrichment of cultural traditions also important aspect.
- * Karahan M, Rashid L, Kratzer J (2022a and b) Gearing-up for purpose: The relationship between entrepreneurs' usage of incubation support services and sustainable impacts. J Clean Prod 377: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2022.134315> can be found twice unnecessary at the references. Please correct references as recommended.

The relationship between networked business incubators and corporate accelerators as regards supporting the birth and development of innovative small firms has not been covered, and thus such sources can be cited:

Lazaroiu, G., Androniceanu, A., Grecu, I., Grecu, G., & Neguriță, O. (2022). Artificial intelligence-based decision-making algorithms, Internet of Things sensing networks, and sustainable cyber-physical management systems in big data-driven cognitive manufacturing. *Oeconomia Copernicana*, 13(4), 1047-1080. <https://doi.org/10.24136/oc.2022.030>

Nagy, M.; Lăzăroi, G.; Valaskova, K. Machine Intelligence and Autonomous Robotic Technologies in the Corporate Context of SMEs: Deep Learning and Virtual Simulation Algorithms, Cyber-Physical Production Networks, and Industry 4.0-Based Manufacturing Systems. *Appl. Sci.* 2023, 13, 1681. <https://doi.org/10.3390/app13031681>

Keep working.

If improvements to the English language within your manuscript have been requested, you should have your manuscript reviewed by someone who is fluent in English. If you would like professional help in revising this manuscript, you can use any reputable English language editing service. We can recommend our affiliates Nature Research Editing Service (<http://bit.ly/NRES-PS>) and American Journal Experts (http://bit.ly/AJE_PS) for help with English usage. Please note that use of an editing service is neither a requirement nor a guarantee of publication. Free assistance is available from our English language tutorial (<https://www.springer.com/gb/authors-editors/authorandreviewertutorials/writinginenglish>) and our Writing resources (<http://www.biomedcentral.com/getpublished/writing-resources>). These cover common mistakes that occur when writing in English.

Did you know Springer Nature Author Services can help you improve your manuscript through services including English language editing, developmental comments, manuscript formatting, figure preparation, translation, and more. Find out more about how you can take advantage of these services: <https://authorservices>.

[springernature.com/go/sn/?utm_source=EM&utm_medium=Revision+Email&utm_campaign=SNAS+Referrals+2023&utm_id=ref2023](https://www.springernature.com/go/sn/?utm_source=EM&utm_medium=Revision+Email&utm_campaign=SNAS+Referrals+2023&utm_id=ref2023)

 Please note that the use of these tools, or any other service, is not a requirement for publication, nor does it imply or guarantee that editors will accept the article, or even select it for peer review.

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jiae/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

2 attachments



06_13__DM_NME_AN-full (1).docx
2993K



reviews.docx
28K